

Figure 3.3 Comparing quantity and quality of student response in two types of discussions.

Traditional Recitation Discussion ^a		Collaborative Reasoning Discussion ^b	
T:	Who is the main character of this story?	T:	The big question is, "Should the coach let Ronald play?"
S:	Ronald.	S:	I don't think so, because he couldn't do anything right.
T:	Yes, and what was the problem he faced in this story?	L:	Yeah, if he was on a team he would make people lose.
S:	He couldn't do anything right.	R:	Nobody would want to pick him.
T:	No, what was he trying to do?	J:	I think he should have a chance to be on the team, because then he might have a chance to get better.
S:	He was trying to play baseball.	B:	That wouldn't be fair, because he would make everybody lose in the meantime.
T:	Yes, so, our stories usually have a problem and a solution. Remember? We talked about that yesterday. So what was the problem in this story?	A:	Winning isn't everything.
S:	(no response)	T:	So. What do you think? "Should the coach let Ronald play?"
T:	Okay, B. Can you help S out?	A:	Maybe the coach could get his dad to practice with him.
B:	He wanted to play, but he ran the bases backward and closed his eyes so he couldn't hit the ball.	G:	When I first started playing baseball, I was scared I'd get hit by the ball, so I wasn't very good at first, but then after a few practices I got better.
T:	Okay, J, what else did he do wrong?	K:	How would you feel if nobody wanted you to play and called you "Four Eyes" just because you wore glasses? I think they ought to let him play.
J:	He drew letters in the mud with a stick?		
T:	Why is that a problem?		

Traditional Recitation Discussion ^a		Collaborative Reasoning Discussion ^b	
B:	He wasn't paying attention to what his coach was telling him?	B:	But the rest of the team would have to suffer until he got better. Wouldn't that make him feel pretty bad? It would me!
T:	Okay, so the problem in the story was that he couldn't do the things he was supposed to be able to do to play ball, he couldn't hit, he couldn't run, and he didn't pay attention. Is that a problem when you want to play ball?	A:	I think he deserves a chance.
		B:	I disagree, because no one would like him then.
Class:	(in unison) Yeeeeesss.		
T:	So the problem Ronald faced in this story was he kept making mistakes every time he tried to play ball. What happened next?		

Source: Clark, A. M., Anderson, R. C., Kuo, L., Kim, I. H., Archodidou, A., & Nguyen-Jahiel, K. (2003). Collaborative reasoning: Expanding ways for children to talk and think in school, p. 182. *Educational Psychology Review*, 15(2), 181–198. Reproduced with permission of Springer New York LLC in the format Book via Copyright Clearance Center.

^aTraditional recitation discussion: nine teacher turns, seven student turns (three different students), one whole-class response.

^bCollaborative reasoning discussion: two teacher turns, twelve student turns (eight different students).

^cT = teacher; B, S, J, G, K = students